State of New York Court of Appeals

Decisions CASES October 20, 2020

1 No. 41 The People &c., Respondent, v. Jonathan Batticks, Appellant.

No. 39 Tobias Bermudez Chavez, et al., Respondents, v. Occidental Chemical Corporation, &c., Appellant.

No. 93

Jesus Ferreira, Appellant, v. City of Binghamton et al., Respondents.

1 No. 44 Patrick Lynch, &c. et al., Appellants, v. City of New York, et al.

City of New York, et al., Respondents. Order affirmed. Opinion by Chief Judge DiFiore. Judges Stein, Garcia and Feinman concur. Judge Wilson dissents in an opinion in which Judges Rivera and Fahey concur.

Following certification of questions by the United States Court of Appeals for the Second Circuit and acceptance of the questions by this Court pursuant to section 500.27 of this Court's Rules of Practice, and after hearing argument by counsel for the parties and consideration of the briefs and record submitted, certified questions answered in the affirmative. Opinion by Judge Stein.

Chief Judge DiFiore and Judges Garcia and Feinman concur.

Judge Rivera dissents in part in an opinion in which Judges Fahey and Wilson concur.

Certification of a question by the United States Court of Appeals for the Second Circuit, pursuant to section 500.27 of this Court's Rules of Practice, accepted and the issues presented are to be considered after briefing and argument.

Chief Judge DiFiore and Judges Rivera, Stein, Fahey, Garcia, Wilson and Feinman concur.

Order reversed, with costs, and judgment of Supreme Court, New York County, reinstated. Opinion by Judge Fahey.

Judges Stein, Garcia, Wilson and Feinman concur. Judge Rivera dissents and votes to affirm in an opinion in which Chief Judge DiFiore concurs.

MOTIONS

2

Mo. No. 2020-447 Motion for leave to appeal dismissed upon the ground that the order sought to be appealed from Bank of America, N.A., does not finally determine the action within the Respondent, meaning of the Constitution. v. Gerald Terry, Appellant, et al., Defendant. 1 Mo. No. 2020-445 Motion for leave to appeal denied. In the Matter of Board of Education of the City School District of the City of New York, Respondent, v. Shelley Jones Crooks, Appellant. 2 Mo. No. 2020-495 Motion for leave to appeal denied with one hundred dollars costs and necessary reproduction Christiana Trust, &c., disbursements. Appellant, v. Himon Barua, Respondent, et al., Defendants.

1 Mo. No. 2020-474 The People &c. ex rel. Charu Anthony Cole, Appellant, v. Warden, Rikers Island, Respondent.

Motion for leave to appeal dismissed upon the ground that the order sought to be appealed from does not finally determine the proceeding within the meaning of the Constitution.

3 Mo. No. 2020-432 Farm Family Casualty Insurance Company, Appellant, v. George B. Henderson, et al., Respondents. Motion for leave to appeal denied with one hundred dollars costs and necessary reproduction disbursements.

2 Mo. No. 2020-453 Joseph Giannone, Jr. et al., Appellants, v. City of New York, Respondent.

2 Mo. No. 2020-486 In the Matter of Michael H., Respondent, v. Kristen L., Appellant.

2 Mo. No. 2020-438 Town of Hempstead, &c., Respondent, v. AJM Capital II, LLC, Appellant.

2 Mo. No. 2020-470 In the Matter of Aliah J.

Administration for Children's Services, Respondent; Candice J., Appellant. (And Two Other Proceedings.) Motion for leave to appeal denied with one hundred dollars costs and necessary reproduction disbursements.

Motion for leave to appeal dismissed upon the ground that the order sought to be appealed from does not finally determine the proceeding within the meaning of the Constitution.

Motion for leave to appeal denied.

Motion, insofar as it seeks leave to appeal from the July 2019 Appellate Division order as against petitioner Administration for Children's Services, dismissed as untimely (*see* CPLR 5513 [b]; 2103 [b] [2]); motion for leave to appeal otherwise denied. Motion for poor person relief dismissed as academic.

3 Mo. No. 2020-380 In the Matter of the Claim of Thomas Johnson, Appellant, v. City of New York, Respondent. Workers' Compensation Board, Respondent.

1 Mo. No. 2020-440 The People &c., Respondent, v. Devonte Kelley, Appellant.

2 Mo. No. 2020-493 The People &c., Respondent, v. Abu Khan, Appellant.

1 Mo. No. 2020-464 In the Matter of KPMG LLP, Appellant, v. Marc S. Kirschner, &c., Respondent.

1 Mo. No. 2020-538 In the Matter of KPMG LLP, Appellant, v. Marc S. Kirschner, &c., Respondent. Motion for leave to appeal granted.

Motion for leave to appeal denied.

Motion for leave to appeal denied.

Motion for leave to appeal denied with one hundred dollars costs and necessary reproduction disbursements.

Motion by New York State Society of CPAs et al. for leave to appear amici curiae on the motion for leave to appeal herein granted and the brief is accepted as filed. 4 Mo. No. 2020-478 In the Matter of DeAnna LeTray, Appellant, v. New York State Division of Human Rights, et al., Respondents.

1 Mo. No. 2020-481 In the Matter of Local 621, &c., et al., Respondents-Appellants, v. New York City Department of Transportation, et al., Appellants-Respondents.

2 Mo. No. 2020-471 Kathlene Marks-Barcia, &c., Appellant, v. Village of Sleepy Hollow Ambulance Corps, et al., Respondents.

4 Mo. No. 2020-398 Neb Morrow, III, Appellant, v. State of New York, Respondent. Motion for leave to appeal denied with one hundred dollars costs and necessary reproduction disbursements.

Motion by appellants-respondents, insofar as it seeks leave to appeal from the November 2019 Appellate Division order, dismissed upon the ground that the order does not finally determine the proceeding/action within the meaning of the Constitution; motion for leave to appeal otherwise dismissed upon the ground that appellantsrespondents are not parties aggrieved by the March 2020 Supreme Court order (*see* CPLR 5511; *Hogan v* Blackburn, 95 NY2d 845 [2000]). Motion by respondents-appellants for leave to appeal dismissed upon the ground that the order sought to be appealed from does not finally determine the proceeding/action within the meaning of the Constitution.

Motion for leave to appeal denied with one hundred dollars costs and necessary reproduction disbursements.

Motion for leave to appeal denied.

2 Mo. No. 2020-425 PFT Technology, LLC, Appellant, v. Robert Wieser, Respondent. Patrick Keelan, et al., Appellants.

Motion for leave to appeal denied with one hundred dollars costs and necessary reproduction disbursements.

1 Mo. No. 2020-452 Prospect Funding Holdings, LLC, Appellant, V. Shannon Paiz, Defendant, Jon L. Norinsberg, &c., et al., Respondents.

3 Mo. No. 2020-475 In the Matter of the State of New York, Respondent, v. Garfield Q., Appellant.

1 Mo. No. 2020-469 In the Matter of Deborah R., Respondent, v. Dean E.H., Appellant. Motion for leave to appeal denied.

Motion for leave to appeal denied.

Motion for leave to appeal denied.

2 Mo. No. 2020-487 Bhupendra K. Shah, Appellant, v. State of New York, Respondent.

2 Mo. No. 2020-494 Sharestates Investments, LLC, Respondent, v. Anyekache Hercules et al., Respondents, James Julius, Appellant, et al., Defendants.

3 Mo. No. 2020-454 In the Matter of the Claim of Carol J. Sischo, Respondent. Safeguard Properties LLC, Appellant. Commissioner of Labor, Respondent.

2 Mo. No. 2020-457 In the Matter of Sound Shore Guild Assn., Inc., Respondent, v. Assessor of the Town of Riverhead, Appellant. Motion, insofar as it seeks leave to appeal from so much of the Appellate Division order as dismissed the appeal from that portion of the Court of Claims order denying reargument, dismissed upon the ground that such portion of the order does not finally determine the action within the meaning of the Constitution; motion for leave to appeal otherwise denied.

Motion for reargument of motion for leave to appeal denied.

Motion for leave to appeal denied.

Motion for leave to appeal denied with one hundred dollars costs and necessary reproduction disbursements.

3 Mo. No. 2020-467 In the Matter of Wayne Spence, &c., et al., Appellants, v. New York State Governor's Office of Employee Relations, et al., Respondents.

Motion for leave to appeal denied with one hundred dollars costs and necessary reproduction disbursements.

Motion for leave to appeal denied.

3 Mo. No. 2020-377 Paul Spinelli, Appellant, v. Eileen B. Spinelli, Respondent.

2 Mo. No. 2020-492 In the Matter of Tasha Straight, Appellant, v. John H. Grant, Respondent. Motion for leave to appeal denied. Motion for poor person relief dismissed as academic.

2 Mo. No. 2020-503 Macarieto I. Trayvilla, &c., et al., Appellants, v. Japan Airlines, &c., et al., Respondents.

1 Mo. No. 2020-570 In the Matter of Baby Boy W., &c.

Jessica W., Appellant; Administration for Children's Services, Respondent. On the Court's own motion, appeal dismissed, without costs, upon the ground that no substantial constitutional question is directly involved. Motion for leave to appeal denied with one hundred dollars costs and necessary reproduction disbursements.

Motion for reargument denied.

3 Mo. No. 2020-468 In the Matter of Amanda YY., Respondent, v. Ramon ZZ., Appellant.

Motion for leave to appeal denied.