State of New York

Court of Appeals

Decisions

April 29, 2021

CASES

2 No. 47 SSM 7 Nadege Odena Jacob, &c., Appellant,

٧.

Franklin Hospital Medical Center, et al., Respondents.

On review of submissions pursuant to section 500.11 of the Rules, order, insofar as appealed from, affirmed, with costs. In response to the prima facie showing of entitlement to summary judgment by defendants Franklin Hospital Medical Center, Abdul Majeed and AM Pulmonary Care, P.C., plaintiff failed to raise a triable issue of fact (*see Mazella v Beals*, 27 NY3d 694 [2016]; *Alvarez v Prospect Hosp.*, 68 NY2d 320, 324-325 [1986]). Chief Judge DiFiore and Judges Rivera, Stein, Fahey, Garcia and Wilson concur.

4 No. 48 SSM 6

Dawn Stefaniak,
Plaintiff,
V.

NFN Zulkharnain,
Appellant.

Roberta L. Reedy, as Administrator of the Estate of Kevin M. Reedy, Deceased,
Respondent.

On review of submissions pursuant to section 500.11 of the Rules, February 2020 order of the Appellate Division insofar as appealed from and July 2014 order of the same court insofar as brought up for review, reversed, with costs, and motion for an award of attorney's fees against defendant denied. Under the circumstances here, the attorney's motion to be appointed, nunc pro tunc, pursuant to 22 NYCRR 36.2 (b) (2), should have been denied (*see generally Gletzer v Harris*, 12 NY3d 468, 476 [2009]). Chief Judge DiFiore and Judges Rivera, Stein, Garcia and Wilson concur. Judge Fahey took no part.

MOTIONS

v.

Richard J. Maglione,

Respondent.

SSD 27 Appeal dismissed without costs, by the Court sua sponte, upon the ground that it does not lie (see 4ALEXF JY L.P., CPLR 5601). Respondent, v. Aziz Uddin Bilal, et al., Defendants. Derrick M. Johnson, Appellant. 2 SSD 25 Appeal dismissed without costs, by the Court sua sponte, upon the ground that no substantial In the Matter of Thomas Adams, constitutional question is directly involved. Appellant, v. Deborah Adams, Respondent. Mo. No. 2021-40 Motion for leave to appeal denied with one hundred dollars costs and necessary reproduction Jo Alloway, et al., disbursements. Appellants, v. Bowlmor AMF Corp., et al., Respondents, et al., Defendants. Mo. No. 2021-46 Motion for leave to appeal denied. Motion for poor person relief dismissed as academic. In the Matter of Toniann M. Amendola, Appellant,

1 Mo. No. 2021-370
Aurora Associates LLC,
Respondent,
V.
Raffaelo Locatelli,
Appellant,
Cleantech Strategies LLC, et al.,
Respondents.

1 Mo. No. 2021-73 In the Matter of Katharine B., Respondent, v.

Thomas L., Appellant.

2 Mo. No. 2020-910
In the Matter of John Borelli, et al.,
Appellants,
v.
City of Yonkers,
Respondent.

2 Mo. No. 2021-87 In the Matter of Cecile D.

Administration for Children's Services,
Respondent;
Kassia D.,
Appellant.
(And Another Proceeding.)

2 SSD 21
Michael A. Deem,
Appellant,
v.
Lorna M. DiMella-Deem,
Respondent.

Motion for leave to appeal dismissed upon the ground that this Court does not have jurisdiction to entertain this motion for leave to appeal from the order of the Appellate Division entered in this proceeding commenced in the Civil Court of the City of New York (*see* NY Const, art VI, § 3 [b] [7]; CPLR 5602 [a]).

Motion for leave to appeal dismissed upon the ground that the order sought to be appealed from does not finally determine the proceeding within the meaning of the Constitution.

Motion for leave to appeal granted.

Motion for leave to appeal denied. Motion for poor person relief dismissed as academic.

Appeal dismissed without costs, by the Court *sua spont*e, upon the ground that the order appealed from does not finally determine the action within the meaning of the Constitution.

2 SSD 24
The People &c.,
Appellant,
v.
Phylip Derival,
Respondent.

4 SSD 22
In the Matter of Andrew DeWolf,
Appellant,

V.

Jamie Syrett, &c., et al., Respondents.

SSD 23

In the Matter of Andrew DeWolf, Appellant,

V

Wayne County, New York, Respondent.

Mo. No. 2021-300

The People &c., Respondent,

v.

Vladimir Duarte, Appellant.

1 Mo. No. 2021-48

In the Matter of Anthony G., Respondent,

v.

Stephanie H.,

Appellant.

Appeal dismissed, by the Court *sua sponte*, upon the ground that the reversal by the Appellate Division was not "on the law alone or upon the law and such facts which, but for the determination of law, would not have led to reversal" (CPL 450.90 [2] [a]).

Appeal dismissed without costs, by the Court *sua sponte*, upon the ground that no substantial constitutional question is directly involved.

On the Court's own motion, appeal transferred, without costs, to the Appellate Division, Fourth Department, upon the ground that a direct appeal does not lie when questions other than the constitutional validity of a statutory provision are involved (*see* NY Const, art VI, §§ 3 [b] [2], 5 [b]; CPLR 5601 [b] [2]).

Motion for assignment of counsel granted and Robert S. Dean, Esq., Center for Appellate Litigation, 120 Wall Street, 28th Floor, New York, NY 10005 assigned as counsel to the appellant on the appeal herein.

2 Mo. No. 2020-833
Michael J. Garcia, &c.,
Respondent,
v.
Peter Garcia,
Appellant.
(And Another Action.)

1 Mo. No. 2021-273 The People &c.,

Respondent,

v.

Michael Hall,

Appellant.

2 Mo. No. 2021-268

The People &c.,

Respondent,

V.

Tyjhe Hargrove,

Appellant.

2 Mo. No. 2021-89

In the Matter of Jahnya.

Cozbi C. et al.,

Respondents;

Camesha B.,

Appellant,

et al.,

Respondent.

(And Another Proceeding.)

Motion for leave to appeal denied.

Motion for an extension of the time within which to apply for permission to appeal pursuant to CPL 460.20 granted and motion papers treated as a timely CPL 460.20 application.

Motion for assignment of counsel granted and Paul Skip Laisure, Esq., Appellate Advocates, 111 John Street, 9th Floor, New York, NY 10038 assigned as counsel to the appellant on the appeal herein.

3 Mo. No. 2021-361 In the Matter of the Claim of Thomas Johnson,

Appellant,

v.

City of New York,

Respondent.

Workers' Compensation Board,

Respondent.

1 Mo. No. 2020-932

F.L.,

Appellant,

v.

J.M.,

Respondent.

2 Mo. No. 2021-59

In the Matter of City of Long Beach, Respondent,

v.

New York State Public Employment Relations Board.

Appellant,

Long Beach Professional Firefighters Association, IAFF, Local 287,

Appellant.

2 Mo. No. 2021-76

In the Matter of City of Long Beach, Respondent,

v.

New York State Public Employment Relations Board,

Appellant,

Long Beach Professional Firefighters Association, IAFF, Local 287, Appellant. Motion by Injured Workers' Bar Association for leave to file a brief amicus curiae on the appeal herein granted and the proposed brief is accepted as filed. Two copies of the brief must be served, nine copies filed, and the brief submitted in digital format within seven days.

Motion for leave to appeal denied.

Motions for leave to appeal granted. Judge Fahey took no part.

Motion by New York State Professional Fire Fighters Association for leave to appear amicus curiae on the motion for leave to appeal by New York State Public Employment Relations Board herein granted and the memorandum of law is accepted as filed.

Judge Fahey took no part.

ground that the issues presented have become moot. In the Matter of Angelina M. Debra Pagano Cohen, Respondent; Mark M., Appellant. Mo. No. 2021-104 Motion for leave to appeal denied. Motion for poor person relief dismissed as academic. The People &c. ex rel. William McCoy, Appellant, v. The People of the State of New York, et al., Respondents. 4 Mo. No. 2021-156 Motion for leave to appeal denied. In the Matter of Anthony Papineau, Respondent, v. Aimee Sanford, Appellant. (And Another Proceeding.) Mo. No. 2021-47 Motion for leave to appeal denied. 1 In the Matter of Eushawn M.R., Appellant, v. Ayonna B., Respondent. Mo. No. 2021-140 Motion for leave to appeal denied. Motion for poor person relief dismissed as academic. In the Matter of Christie E.R., Appellant, v.

Motion for leave to appeal dismissed upon the

Mo. No. 2021-207

Pedro J.D.,

Respondent.

1 Mo. No. 2020-888 In the Matter of Amir R. et al., &c.

Motion for leave to appeal denied. Motion for poor person relief dismissed as academic.

David M., III,

Appellant;

Administration for Children's Services, Respondent.

2 Mo. No. 2021-100

The People &c.,

Appellant,

v.

Luis A. Rodriguez,

Respondent.

4 Mo. No. 2020-951 In the Matter of Irelynn S.

Onondaga County Department of Children and Family Services,
Respondent;

Maurice S.,

Appellant.

2 SSD 19

Olabisi Salis,

Respondent,

v.

Owolabi Mohammed Salis,

Appellant.

4 Mo. No. 2021-103

In the Matter of Stacy L. Sawyer,

Appellant,

v.

Matthew J. Doyle,

Respondent.

Motion to dismiss appeal denied.

Motion for leave to appeal granted. Motion for poor person relief granted.

Appeal dismissed without costs, by the Court *sua sponte*, upon the ground that no appeal lies to this Court from the order of an individual Justice of the Appellate Division (*see* NY Const, art VI, § 3 [b]; CPLR 5601).

1 SSD 20

The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-Day Saints,

Plaintiff,

Servant: Xiu Jian Sun, The Spiritual Adam, Appellant,

v.

Northwell Health, et al., Respondents.

SSD 26

Trenton Business Assistance Corporation, &c.,

Appellant,

v.

Maureen O'Connell, &c., et al.,

Defendants,

Nonie Manion, &c. et al.,

Respondents.

2 Mo. No. 2021-56

U.S. Bank National Association, &c., Respondent,

v.

Pamela Donovan,

Appellant,

et al..

Defendants.

3 Mo. No. 2021-82

In the Matter of Dakota W., et al., &c.

Broome County Department of Social Services,

Respondent;

Kimberly X.,

Appellant,

et al.,

Respondent.

Appeal dismissed without costs, by the Court *sua sponte*, upon the ground that the order appealed from does not finally determine the action within the meaning of the Constitution.

Appeal dismissed without costs, by the Court *sua sponte*, upon the ground that no substantial constitutional question is directly involved.

Motion for leave to appeal dismissed upon the ground that the order sought to be appealed from does not finally determine the action within the meaning of the Constitution.

4 Mo. No. 2021-113
In the Matter of James V. Williams,
Appellant,
v.

Krystal D. Richardson, Respondent.

Motion for leave to appeal denied. Motion for poor person relief dismissed as academic.